

Error Analysis Found in Students' Narrative Text Writing: A Study at the Tenth Grade Students of SMAN 4 Kota Serang**Analisis Kesalahan yang Ditemukan dalam Penulisan Teks Naratif Siswa: Sebuah Studi pada Siswa Kelas Sepuluh di SMAN 4 Kota Serang**

Salzha Terenovix¹, Rita Handayani^{2*}, Tita Irawati³, Muhammad Bayu Heri Permana⁴, Nurul Habibaturosyi'ah⁵

^{1,2,4,5}**University of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa, ³SMA Negeri 4 Kota Serang**

Email: ¹salzhatn@gmail.com, ²rita_h@untirta.ac.id, ³titairawati00@guru.sma.belajar.id,

⁴mhmmdbyhrprmn@gmail.com, ⁵nurulhabibatur09@gmail.com

*Corresponding Author

Received : Oktober 2023, Revised : November 2023, Accepted : November 2023

ABSTRACT

Mastering the four basic English skills, particularly writing, is crucial for effective communication. However, numerous EFL students in Indonesia encounter challenges due to the disparities in language structure, grammar, and language style between Bahasa Indonesia and English. These challenges can lead to difficulties in constructing sentences and applying correct tenses, resulting in grammatical errors. This study investigates grammatical errors in students' narrative text writing, focusing on grammar, spelling, punctuation, and capitalization. Both qualitative and quantitative methods were employed in this study. There were 10 students from the X MIPA 3 class at SMAN 4 Kota Serang involved as the participants in this study. The data were collected through document analysis and interviews. The result showed that there were 67 errors found in students' writing narrative composition which were classified into four categories: (1) 39 grammar errors (50.64%), (2) 2 spelling errors (2.59%) (3) 15 punctuation errors (19.48%), and (4) 21 capitalization errors (27.27%). The factors that contributed to students' writing difficulties include: (1) a lack of understanding of the learning materials, (2) difficulty in generating ideas during the writing process, and (3) unfamiliarity with English grammar and vocabulary. The students address these challenges by seeking for information from the internet, books, and friends.

Keywords: Error Analysis, Writing, Narrative Text

ABSTRAK

Menguasai keempat keterampilan dasar Bahasa Inggris, khususnya menulis, sangat penting untuk komunikasi yang efektif. Namun, banyak siswa EFL di Indonesia mengalami kesulitan dalam menulis yang disebabkan oleh perbedaan struktur bahasa, tata bahasa, serta gaya bahasa antara Bahasa Indonesia dan Bahasa Inggris. Tantangan ini dapat menyebabkan kesulitan dalam menyusun kalimat dan menerapkan tenses yang benar, yang berujung pada kesalahan gramatikal. Penelitian ini menyelidiki kesalahan gramatikal dalam penulisan teks naratif siswa, berfokus pada tata bahasa, ejaan, tanda baca, dan kapitalisasi. Metode kualitatif dan kuantitatif digunakan dalam penelitian ini. Sebanyak 10 siswa dari kelas X MIPA 3 di SMAN 4 Kota Serang menjadi partisipan dalam penelitian ini. Data-data dalam penelitian ini dikumpulkan melalui analisis dokumen dan wawancara. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa terdapat 67 kesalahan dalam penulisan teks naratif siswa yang terklasifikasi dalam empat kategori: (1) 39 kesalahan tata bahasa (50,64%), (2) 2 kesalahan ejaan (2,59%), (3) 15 kesalahan tanda baca (19,48%), dan (4) 21 kesalahan kapitalisasi (27,27%). Faktor-faktor yang menyebabkan kesulitan menulis siswa meliputi: (1) kurangnya pemahaman terhadap materi pembelajaran, (2) kesulitan menghasilkan ide selama proses penulisan, dan (3) ketidakfamiliaran dengan tata bahasa dan kosakata Bahasa Inggris. Siswa mengatasi tantangan ini dengan mencari informasi dari internet, buku, dan teman.

Kata Kunci: Analisis Kesalahan, Menulis, Teks Naratif

1. Introduction

English is an important and widely spoken language. It acts as a bridge between cultures and nations and is used in all aspects of life. It is also a subject that all students in Indonesia must study in school (Hashim & Yunus, 2018). The purpose of English teaching is to develop students' ability to communicate in both spoken and written forms. Furthermore, English became the second and foreign language required of everyone seeking to communicate globally. In order to communicate well in English, students must be able to talk, write, read, and listen. Therefore, mastering all four language skills—listening, speaking, reading, and writing—is necessary for efficient information and idea exchanges and for the development of full communication ability (Sharma & Puri, 2021). These skills can be thought of as the foundations for mastering the language. Since students typically take in information passively through listening or reading, both are referred to as receptive or passive skills. Speaking and writing, on the other hand, are considered productive or active skills. These skills involve actively using the language to communicate and express ideas.

Among the active skills in mastering English, writing stands out as a powerful medium through which students can convey their creativity, share knowledge, and make a lasting impact on those who read them. It is one of the most essential active skills that most people have developed throughout the course of their education. Therefore, writing is a complex activity that takes time and requires cognitively demanding skills like critical thinking and logical development of ideas, which students of English should master (Bakoko & Pratiwi, 2021). However, engaging in writing activities contributes to the enhancement of students' proficiency in expressing their ideas through written expression. Within written tasks, students can exhibit their capability to 1) produce appropriate and substantial content, 2) establish a coherent organization of their thoughts, 3) employ accurate terminology and a rich vocabulary, 4) adhere to grammar and sentence structure conventions, and 5) apply proper mechanics, encompassing the visual arrangement of the writing format (Suryanto & Sari, 2021). These aspects form the basis of the writing assessment used to evaluate students' writing proficiency. In conclusion, a writing process highlights the steps students take to create their final written product, emphasizing the content they create as a result of thoughtful preparation and planning.

There are many types of text in writing, one of which is narrative. A narrative text is a story in which the writer tells a description of events or a true event that occurred; it is also a connected sequence of events with a cause-and-effect relationship in the story (Prihandani, 2023). In relation to this study, the writing text focused on narrative composition, specifically exploring a vacation plan written in the simple future tense by senior high school students in the tenth grade. This aligns with the prescribed text types mandated by the English Curriculum of 2013.

Additionally, EFL (English as a Foreign Language) students in Indonesia face challenges in mastering writing skills due to differences in language structure, grammar, and style between Bahasa and English (Sukandi & Syafar, 2018). Students need to comprehend language components such as spelling, grammar, vocabulary, and punctuation when writing. This implies that they should learn not only vocabulary but also grammar, where they frequently make mistakes. Grammar mastery is essential for students when writing; as it is critical in preventing miscommunications. Grammar is concerned with language rules, sentence structure, and how words combine to form correct sentences (Vera, Haryudin, & Herdiyanti, 2019). Therefore, in order to develop a good writing product, grammar must be considered when developing sentences.

Thus, writing is a challenging skill where students create sentences that need to be organized into coherent paragraphs. English writing can be tough for students, often leading to errors influenced by the sentence structure of their first language, Bahasa Indonesia. These errors are a natural part of the learning process and help students grasp the rules of English.

Identifying and analyzing these errors through error analysis is essential. It provides valuable feedback to both students and teachers, facilitating better English teaching and learning (Fitria, 2019). Students often struggle with sentence construction and tenses, resulting in grammatical mistakes due to the absence of specific rules for verb forms influenced by their first language, Bahasa Indonesia.

Therefore, the following two questions will be addressed in this study: (1) what are the most dominant errors in students' narrative text writing, and (2) what factors contribute to students' narrative text writing errors?

2. Methodology

This study employed both qualitative and quantitative methods to identify and analyze grammatical errors and challenges faced by students in writing narrative texts. The qualitative method was employed to analyze the errors found in students' writing. A qualitative research design was adopted to help evaluate and analyze the selected systematic reviews to help answer the research question and achieve the goals and objectives of the research (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). Meanwhile, the quantitative method was employed to calculate the error frequencies by using the formula:

$$P = \frac{F}{N} \times 100\%$$

Notice: P = Percentage

F = Frequency of errors

N = Number of cases (total word)

The participants of this study involved 10 students from the X MIPA 3 class at SMAN 4 Kota Serang. The study utilized document analysis and interviews as the data collecting technique. Document analysis was employed to gather the errors in students' writing, while interviews were conducted to understand the difficulties students faced. In conducting this research, the following steps were employed for data analysis:

- 1) Gathering and examining the results for errors in students' narrative writing.
- 2) Identifying and classifying the errors in grammar (such as nouns, verbs, determiners, pronouns, and prepositions), spelling, punctuation, and capitalization.
- 3) Calculating the percentage of errors using the formula: $P = \frac{F}{N} \times 100\%$.
- 4) Conducting interviews with 10 students based on the results of the former analysis.
- 5) Analyzing the errors found and the result of the interview for further elaboration.
- 6) Elaborating the findings and discussions to derive meaningful insights.

It is hoped that this study can provide a comprehensive understanding of students' grammatical errors in writing narrative texts and the challenges they encountered during the writing process

3. Result And Discussion

Result

The result of this study aimed to address the formulated research questions outlined in the background of the study. Specifically, the objectives were to identify the most dominant errors in students' narrative text writing and to find out the factors that contribute to the students' errors in writing narrative text. The following sections provide an in-depth error analysis and a detailed description of the research data:

Grammar

Grammar involves examining the structure of sentences that convey meaning (Thornbury, 1999). It is the process through which language arranges and integrates words to create more extensive units of meaning (Ur, 1991). The findings of this study reveal numerous

grammatical errors in students' narrative writing, particularly concerning nouns, verbs, determiners, pronouns, and prepositions. A detailed exploration of these errors will be explained as follows:

a. Noun

In the first composition, for example:

Incorrect : ...*we will visit Borobudur temple.*

Correct : ...*we will visit Borobudur Temple.*

The first example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of nouns. In this case, it appears that "temple" refers to a specific place, likely a proper noun, such as "Borobudur Temple." Proper nouns, which include the names of specific places, should be capitalized in English. Therefore, the correction involves capitalizing "temple" to "Temple" to reflect that it is a specific, proper noun, in this case, the name of a temple.

In the third composition, for example:

Incorrect : ...*I will met nct.*

Correct : ...*I will meet NCT.*

The second example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of nouns. In this case, "NCT" is an abbreviation that refers to a specific entity or group. Abbreviations, particularly those that represent proper nouns or specific names, should be capitalized in English. Therefore, the correction involves capitalizing "nct" to "NCT" to reflect that it is an abbreviation.

In the sixth composition, for example:

Incorrect : *I will see grandfather plantation in the backyard.*

Correct : *I will see grandfather's plantation in the backyard.*

The third example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of nouns. In this case, "grandfather plantation" implies possession, meaning that the plantation belongs to the writer's grandfather. To indicate possession correctly, an apostrophe and "s" ('s) should be added to "grandfather," resulting in "grandfather's plantation." This modification clarifies that the plantation belongs to the writer's grandfather, making it grammatically correct.

b. Verb

In the second composition, for example:

Incorrect : *Do you wanna see it?*

Correct : *Do you want to see it?*

The first example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of verb. In this case, the word "wanna" is an informal contraction of the verb phrase "want to." While "wanna" is commonly used in casual or spoken language, it is considered informal and should be avoided in more formal or written contexts.

In the third composition, for example:

Incorrect : ...*I will met nct.*

Correct : ...*I will meet nct.*

The second example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of verb. In this case, the verb "met" is in the past tense form, which is incorrect for this sentence. The correct form should be "meet" in the future tense to indicate that the action will take place in the future.

In the eighth composition, for example:

Incorrect : ...*i will to try surabi...*

Correct : ...*i will try Surabi...*

The third example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of verb. In this case, the word "to" is used before the verb "try," which is unnecessary and incorrect. In English, verbs that follow modal verbs (such as "will") or certain other constructions do not require the infinitive marker "to." The verb should directly follow the modal verb.

c. Determiner

In the seventh composition, for example:

Incorrect : *I am going to have **long holiday** of this semester.*

Correct : *I am going to have **a long holiday** of this semester.*

The example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of determiner. In English, it is common and grammatically correct to use determiners or articles before nouns to specify their countability and whether they are definite or indefinite. In this context, the addition of the indefinite article "a" is needed to indicate that the writer is going to have a single, specific long holiday.

d. Pronoun

In the third composition, for example:

Incorrect : ***I and my pen friend** will go around the city of Busan.*

Correct : ***My pen friend and I** will go around the city of Busan.*

The example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of pronoun. In this context, there is an incorrect order of pronouns in the sentence, "I and my pen friend..." The correct order should be, "My pen friend and I..."

e. Preposition

In the first composition, for example:

Incorrect : *...we will buy Bakpia **from** Yogyakarta.*

Correct : *...we will buy Bakpia **in** Yogyakarta.*

The third example above highlights a grammatical error, particularly in the case of preposition. In this case, the preposition "from" should be changed to "in" to clarify that Bakpia is a product from Yogyakarta.

Spelling

Spelling refers to the act of forming words correctly from individual letters (Hornby, 1974). The findings of this study reveal several spelling errors in students' narrative writing. A detailed exploration of these errors will be explained as follows:

In the second composition, for example:

Incorrect : *...I want to try drink a cup of **coffe**...*

Correct : *...I want to try to drink a cup of **coffee**...*

The first example above highlights that there is a spelling error, particularly in the case of "coffee." In this case, "coffe" should be written as "coffee" for formal writing or standard English. It is recommended to use the standard spelling, "coffee," to ensure clarity and consistency in the writing.

In the fifth composition, for example:

Incorrect : *me and my family will visit Bali **Tomorrow**.*

Correct : *Me and my family will visit Bali **tomorrow**.*

The last example above highlights that there is also a spelling error, particularly in the case of "Tomorrow." In this case, the correct spelling is "tomorrow." It also should not be capitalized because it is not the first word in the sentence. So, it should be "tomorrow."

Punctuation

Punctuation is described as a mark that allows writers to define statements and enhance communication with readers (Samson, 2014). The purpose of punctuation is to provide clarity in written language (Ritter, 2002). The findings of this study reveal numerous punctuation errors in students' narrative writing. A detailed exploration of these errors will be explained as follows:

In the first composition, for example:

Incorrect : ***after that** we will visit the food store.*

Correct : ***After that**, we will visit the food store.*

The example above highlights a punctuation error, particularly in the use of punctuation marks in the sentence "after that we will visit the food store.". The comma in the sentence "After that, we will visit the food store" is added for clarity and to indicate a brief pause. In this case, the comma is used as a form of punctuation to set off the introductory phrase "after that."

In the ninth composition, for example:

Incorrect : *we will play gondola in **TMII** we are going to next destination to **kota tua** we will eat kerak telur*

Correct : *We will play gondola in **TMII**. We are going to next destination to **kota tua**. We will eat kerak telur.*

The example above highlights a punctuation error, particularly in the use of punctuation marks in the sentences. In this case, there are no periods (full stops) at the end of each sentence. This disrupts proper punctuation and does not follow the English standard writing. It's also important to capitalize the first word of each sentence. By adding periods and addressing these capitalization issues, the sentences become correct and grammatically sound. Proper punctuation is crucial for clear and coherent written communication.

Capitalization

Capitalization in writing refers to the utilization of uppercase letters, such as at the beginning of a sentence, following a period, and within quotation marks (Mikheev, 1999). The findings of this study reveal numerous capitalization errors in students' narrative writing. These errors include inaccuracies in capitalizing the first word of a sentence, names of places, names of traditional foods, etc. A detailed exploration of these errors will be explained as follows:

In the fifth composition, for example:

Incorrect : ***we** are going to watch the sunset.*

Correct : ***We** are going to watch the sunset.*

The example above highlights that there is a capitalization error. In this case, "we" should be "We" because it is the first word of a sentence or after a period.

These results highlight the diverse nature of errors present in the students' narrative writing.

Discussion

According to the result of the interview, the majority of students found writing to be a challenging skill to master and expressed the difficulties they faced in mastering this skill. These challenges significantly impacted their self-confidence when writing English.

The following table shows the result of students' narrative writing compositions, highlighting instances of errors in grammar, spelling, punctuation, and capitalization.

Table 1. Errors found in students' writing compositions

Aspect	Grammar					Spel.	Punc.	Cap.
	Noun	Verb	Det.	Pro.	Prep.			
	18	10	2	4	5			
	23.37%	12.98%	2.59%	5.19%	6.49%	2	15	21
Total	39							
%	50.64%					2.59%	19.48%	27.27%

Notice: Det. = Determiner
 Pro. = Pronoun
 Prep. = Preposition
 Spel. = Spelling
 Punc. = Punctuation
 Cap. = Capitalization

According to the table above, it can be seen that students' errors in writing narrative composition can be classified into four categories: grammar, spelling, punctuation, and capitalization issues. There were a total of 67 mistakes committed by students. The frequency and percentage of the four types are as follows: The first number of grammar errors was 39, with a proportion of 50.64%. The second is spelling errors, which have two items and a percentage of 2.59%. The third category is punctuation error, which has 15 entries with a percentage of 19.48%. The final category is capitalization error, which has 21 items and a percentage of 27.27%. Grammar errors are the most dominant among students, accounting for 39 items and accounting for 50.64% of all errors.

The predominant error observed in students' narrative text writing is grammatical, specifically involving various word classes such as nouns, verbs, determiners, pronouns, and prepositions. In terms of nouns, the errors include possession errors, capitalization errors in proper nouns, and redundancy through unnecessary noun usage. In terms of verbs, informal and absent forms, as well as misused gerunds, are misused. Additionally, there is a lack of appropriate determiners, and the misuse of prepositions and pronouns is also noted in the writing. Align with this issue, the result of the interview indicated that 9 to 10 students are still struggling to understand English grammar, finding it confusing and difficult. Grammar plays an important role in writing, yet students often struggle with English grammar because they find it difficult (Sa'adah, 2020).

The second most dominant type of error in students' narrative writing is related to capitalization. Capitalization has been found to be a problem for many EFL students (Manzolim & Gumpal, 2015). The errors found involved the incorrect use of uppercase and lowercase letters, such as writing "I" as a subject pronoun in lowercase "i". Another instance is the incorrect capitalization of the word "we," which should be in uppercase when positioned as the first word of a sentence. There are also proper noun capitalization errors in which they should begin the first word with uppercase.

Punctuation errors served as the third type of error identified in students writing composition. There are some issues in this study: 1) Commas: unnecessary commas, as well as missing commas after introduction phrases like "After that" and "Then" require the addition of a comma; 2) Period: there are numerous missing periods that should have been used to end sentences. Aligning with this issue, the result of the interview revealed that most students still struggle with capitalization, often forgetting its correct usage.

The least common type of error identified in students' writing compositions is related to spelling. There are two misspelled words in this study: "coffe" and "tommorrow." However, it is noted that despite being misspelled, these words are contextually appropriate. The correct spellings should be "coffee" and "tomorrow." Relating to this issue, the result of the interview showed that most students find spelling English words challenging due to their unfamiliarity with the English words. Spelling errors are commonly found in students writing mainly due to a lack of mastery of spelling rules and a lack of accuracy in writing (Mustadi & Amalia, 2020). When delving into the reasons behind these issues, students pointed out three main factors. The first factor is a lack of understanding of the learning materials. Students are struggling with writing skills due to poor understanding of the learning materials (Kenta & Bosha, 2019). The second factor is the difficulty in generating ideas during the writing process. When writing English, students find it hard to express their ideas, causing many mistakes in terms of grammar and vocabulary (Sun, 2010). The third factor is the unfamiliarity with the grammar and vocabulary. Students may find writing to be challenging since they face difficulties that are mainly caused by their limitation of English grammar and less of English vocabulary (Octaviana, 2016). To overcome these challenges, students employ various strategies, including seeking for information from the internet and books, as well as asking help from friends

4. Conclusion

This research focuses on analyzing grammatical errors in students' narrative writing. As indicated by the table, students' narrative composition errors are categorized into grammar, spelling, punctuation, and capitalization, totaling 67 mistakes. Grammatical errors, constituting 50.64%, are the most predominant, reflecting challenges in various word classes. Capitalization, the second most common error, presents challenges in uppercase and lowercase usage, particularly with personal pronouns and proper nouns. Punctuation errors, the third type, involve both unnecessary and missing commas and periods. Spelling errors, the least frequent, include two misspelled words: "coffe" and "tomorrow." These writing issues are caused from students' lack of understanding of learning materials, difficulty in generating ideas, and unfamiliarity with English grammar and vocabulary. However, students address these challenges by seeking for information from the internet, books, and friends

References

- Bakoko, R., & Pratiwi, D. I. (2021). The application of cooperative principle in learning spoken English. *International Journal of Education and Language*, 1(1), 1-10. doi:10.5349/ijel.v1i01.
- Fitria, T. N. (2019). Errors in students' writing composition in simple present tense "my daily activity". *Edulange: Journal of English Language Education*, 2(1), 47-62.
- Hashim, H. U., & Yunus, M. M. (2018). English as a Second Language (ESL) Learning: Setting the Right Environment for Second Language Acquisition. *Tadris: Jurnal Keguruan Dan Ilmu Tarbiyah*, 3(2), 207. doi:10.24042/tadris.v3i2.2941.
- Hornby, A. S. (1974). *Oxford Learner's Dictionary of Current English*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kenta, A. E., & Bosha, T. B. (2019). An Investigation into Factors that Affect Students' Writing Skills: The Case of Sodo Secondary School. *English Language, Literature & Culture*, 4(2).
- Manzolim, H. A., & Gumpal, B. (2015). Isabela State University Rural Campus Written Compositions: An Error Analysis. *The Country Side Development Research Journal*, 3(1).
- Mikheev, A. (1999). A Knowledge-free Method for Capitalized Word Disambiguation. *Proceedings of the 37th Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics* (pp. 159–166). College Park: Association for Computational Linguistics.
- Mustadi, A., & Amalia, M. (2020). Spelling writing error analysis in nonfiction essay of elementary students. *Jurnal Prima Edukasia*, 82.
- Octaviana, D. W. (2016). Students' Perceptions toward Their Writing in EFL Setting: A Study at SMA YKBBB Leles Garut. *TELL – US Journal*, 2(1).
- Prihandani, A. M. (2023). An Analysis of Students' Grammatical Errors in Writing Narrative Texts. *International Journal Of Language And Literature*, 60-66. doi:10.23887/ijll.v7i2.29453
- Ritter, R. M. (2002). *he Oxford Guide to Style*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Sa'adah, A. R. (2020). Writing Skill in Teaching English: An Overview. *Educasia*, 5(1).
- Samson, D. (2014). Teaching punctuation. *Virginia English Journal*, 64.
- Sharma, C., & Puri, S. R. (2021). The importance of four basic skills in learning English. *The Genesis*, 7(4), 33-36. doi:10.47211/tg.2020.v07i04.00
- Sukandi, S. S., & Syafar, D. N. (2018). EFL students' responses to learning basic reading and writing skills. *Studies in English Language and Education*, 5(1), 40–53. doi:10.24815/siele.v5i1.8419.
- Sun, F. (2010). Pedagogical Implications to Teaching English Writing. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 1(6).

- Suryanto, & Sari, Z. E. (2021). Difficulties and Strategies in Learning English: An Analysis of Students From English and Non-English Education Department in Indonesia. 518 (*ICoSIHESS 2020*), 313–331. doi:10.2991/assehr.k.210120.140.
- Thornbury, S. (1999). *How to Teach Grammar*. Essex: Pearson Education Limited.
- Ur, P. (1991). *A Course in Language Teaching: Practice and Theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Vera, B., Haryudin, A., & Herdiyanti. (2019). Error analysis on the students writing of simple present tense in a descriptive text. *PROJECT: Professional Journal of English Education*, 2(4), 514-520.